

Seil and Easdale Community Council

Notes of Public Meeting

Tuesday 23rd November 2010 – Seil Island Hall

1. Present:

- **Community Councillors:** Seumas Anderson (Chair), Heather Chaplin, Alan MacFadyen, Martin Waddell, Anne-Marie Robin, Robert Rae, Charles Struthers, Mike Shaw.
- **Council members:** Cllr Neil MacKay
- **Members of the public:** 15 including Jane Nichols (Sec)

2. Apologies for absence:

Tina Jordan, Chris Dugdale, Inspector Julie McLeish, Police Constable Jeremy Moore, Cllr Donald MacDonald, Cllr Elaine Robertson, Cllr Duncan MacIntyre.

3. Minutes of last meeting:

One amendment was requested. At the bottom of page one, the last sentence should begin with 'Someone who themselves has impaired mobility commented that...'.
The minutes were then proposed by Jenny Tarbatt and seconded by Mike Shaw.

4. Matters arising:

a) **Police Report**

With no members of the local police in attendance, the Chair noted that the Oban Police community newsletter was amongst the tabled documents.

b) **Planning Matters**

i. The following 4 applications were noted:

| | | |
|--------------|--|---|
| 10/01765/NMA | East Side Of B844 Balvicar Bay Clachan Seil Isle Of Seil Oban Argyll And Bute PA34 4TL | Non Material Amendment to 08/01001/DET (Combined waste water treatment works with formation of access lay-by) for removal of membrane plant covers and sludge tank. |
| 10/01729/PP | Easdale Island Community Hall Easdale Island Oban Argyll And Bute PA34 4TB | Installation of solar PV panels and air source heat pump |
| 10/01657/PP | Cnoc Crom Clachan Seil Isle Of Seil Oban Argyll And Bute PA34 4QZ | Formation of terraced deck |
| 10/01586/PP | Plot South Of Former Manse Balvicar Isle Of Seil Oban Argyll And Bute PA34 4TF | Erection of dwellinghouse and associated works. |

The first of these has been withdrawn, although it is unclear whether or not this means the covers will be provided. Cllr MacKay commented that it might be appropriate for the Community Council, as statutory consultees, to seek clarification on whether or not the applicant has complied with all requirements according to the original planning application for the waste water treatment works.

- ii. Henry Tarbatt noted that the planning application for an air source heat pump at Easdale Hall had been submitted without any consultation with members of the Easdale Island community. There has been considerable discussion on this application and the level of noise it is expected to generate. This is a concern as one reason people visit Easdale is because of the peace and quiet associated with the island. The question was raised as to whether the pump could be enclosed in order to minimise the noise, but it was noted that this type of pump requires direct contact with the surrounding air in order to fulfil its function. It might be possible to install an attenuator, but that would increase the visual impact on the hall. Heather Chaplin added that the solar panels to be located on the hall are of a straight-edged design that is out of keeping with the surroundings, and she would like more information on them before the application proceeds. Keith Oversby has already made direct representation to Argyll & Bute Council about this application, and he has sent a copy to the Community Council.
- iii. The application for a wind turbine on Easdale has been withdrawn for the time being. Heather reported that a circular on the subject had gone to residents, and it is understood that the application may be resubmitted with a revised position for the turbine, further away from the houses. Henry asked those present to consider that the height of the land at the turbine location combined with the height of the turbine itself, would make it taller than the highest point on the island.
- iv. A pre-application consultation paper has been received for a marine pen fish farm to be relocated from its current position opposite Ardmaddy Bay to a point 900 metres further south. Also to change the type of farming operation approved at that location from mussels to salmon. There was discussion as to the environmental impact of the move, and also as to whether the new site would impede the path of boats travelling past the spot.

c) Raera Wind Farm update

- i. The planning application has been recommended for refusal by the planning committee. It will now go to a public hearing, to take place on 14th December in Kilmelford Hall.
- ii. Cllr MacKay explained the process to be undergone. Everyone who has corresponded on the planning application, including Seil and Easdale Community Council, will be informed of the details of the public hearing. The council planning department will have approximately 30 minutes to present, then other speakers will be invited to contribute. Everyone who wishes to speak in response will be given 30 minutes in total. Those who wish to speak will have to decide amongst themselves if certain of them will represent the others, thereby reducing the number of speakers. After this, the committee will ask questions of the speakers in order to clarify any points. After summing up, the committee will debate the issues in public and then give their decision either for or against support of the planning committee's decision.
- iii. Following the hearing, the developers can appeal if their application is turned down. But if their application is supported, those opposing it have no right of appeal. There followed a discussion in which Cllr MacKay clarified a number of

points on the hearing process.

- iv. John Wilson asked Cllr MacKay to comment on the fact that the planning area of the council's website stated that not all planning applications had to be published on the website, although they do all have to be published in the local paper. Cllr MacKay thought it might be a technical issue, and said that he would check and report back.

d) Clachan Wind Farm update

- i. Photo montages were sent to PACT and used in their meeting. The archaeology report has been done, and the application for planning is expected in January. When the application goes live, Seil and Easdale Community Council will carry out a survey and use the results to inform its representation to Argyll & Bute Council. The community council is confident that it can do so within the 28-day deadline from the date of the application being lodged, and the Chair stated that everyone on the edited electoral roll will be surveyed. The developer is still offering to arrange visits to wind farms similar to the one proposed.
- ii. Robert Rae expressed concern that the archaeology report may not have been thorough, as there is a possible bronze-age settlement that may have been overlooked. He asked if a local guide had been sought by those carrying out the archaeological survey. The developer has previously promised to protect some stones and some of these have been fenced off, but some have been left unprotected. It was noted that clarification on the scope of the survey could be sought from the developer, as he commissioned the survey, and that such correspondence could be advantageous.

e) Health Matters

The Chair read out the health services report that was compiled by Tina Jordan. The first item was a report on the Area Public Partnership Forum on 16th Nov, at which a paper entitled 'NHS Highland Vision' was presented. This paper suggests there will be significant changes in delivery of health services over the next 5 years. Greater emphasis is to be placed on the promotion of good health, self care and independence; community based care; integration with local authority, voluntary and private sectors; staff training and motivation; zero wastage and inefficiently with no unnecessary overheads.

Dr George Hannah commented that in future those who work within the health services will have to work within the parameters of this paper, although it is difficult to say exactly what the effect will be on local services.

The newsletter update on the redesign of mental health services was also tabled.

f) Scottish Water

- i. David Innes, Scottish Water project manager for the works on Seil, was scheduled to present at this meeting on how he would be approaching the outstanding problems. Charles Struthers expressed disappointment that Mr Innes had cancelled at the last minute, stating that he would instead address each item on the list of problems on an individual basis.
- ii. Charles summarised his report of the meeting he had with David Innes. He explained that although various contractors have been involved with the waste water treatment works on Seil, Scottish Water now has sole responsibility for it,

and David Innes is the person in charge. Charles has compiled a list of major objections and provided it to Mr Innes, who was surprised at the number of complaints. Most of the complaints are about landscaping, and it is hoped that these can be relatively easily resolved. Problems of water drainage, particularly where the Roads Authority is involved, may prove more complicated to solve. David Innes will be on Seil roughly 3 days per week over the next few months and will over that time work through the list of complaints, visit the parties involved, and hopefully design suitable solutions to all of them.

- iii. Various comments were made on outstanding issues. These included the promised septic tanks at Whinbank, of which Dr Hannah will let Charles have details. John Wilson reported that regarding the discharge of sewage into the sea, divers could testify to the impact of this on the sea bed, and he was asked to put this in writing to Charles. Mike Shaw confirmed that members of the public are responsible for the disposal of their own septic tanks that have been made redundant by connection to the new treatment system, even though contractors offered to fill in some of them.
- iv. John Wilson asked if Scottish Water have commented on the fact that the system doesn't work. Charles Struthers said that Scottish Water stated that it is the best system in the world, and that they would make it work.
- v. Mike Shaw reminded the meeting that the Chair of Scottish Water, Ronnie Mercer, wrote to the Community Council in July giving assurances that Scottish Water aims to address these customer complaints as quickly and efficiently as possible. In light of this, Cllr MacKay asked that Charles forward to him details of all correspondence and a list of the complaints, and Cllr MacKay will try to arrange a meeting between himself, Scottish Water and representatives of the Community Council. This would be the first step in the escalation of these complaints. Charles asked the secretary to make sure the Seilachan summary of these minutes includes a request for community members to email him details of any other complaints connected with Scottish Water.

g) Local Roads Update

- i. Charles Struthers reported that the resurfacing has been completed. If there is any money next year, the Roads Departments will surface dress what they have just resurfaced, as well as the best of the remaining roads on Seil. Charles asked people to notify the Roads Department on 01546 605514 of any potholes that appear. Legally the council only have to inspect the roads annually for defects, but are well ahead of that.
- ii. Amongst road-related issues, the requested bus shelter for Ellenabeich has still to be pursued. Also, Heather Chaplin reported that she has been asked about the possibility of a single street light at the bus shelter at Clachan.

5. Other Business

a) Scottish Ambulance Service

Gary Fraser, head of the Scottish Ambulance Service, was due to make a presentation to the meeting on the scheme for helicopter landing lights for emergency evacuation on Easdale Island. Gary could not unfortunately attend,

so instead Keith Oversby, Secretary of Easdale Residents' Association, gave a brief update.

There was a meeting with Gary Fraser earlier this year, at which the landing lights were discussed. Keith has had notification that the lights will be deployed. There has been a good response to the request for volunteers, with 14 people volunteering to help deploy the lights, and 12 people offering to be first point of contact. The latter is normally the fire department, and they may in fact be involved in this case.

The next step is that pilots are coming in December to survey the proposed landing site. It hasn't yet been decided who will pay for the lights, of which 12 are needed at around £1,000 each, but it is hoped that the Scottish Ambulance Service will pay.

b) Community Engagement Meeting

The Chair attended the meeting, at which 5 Argyll & Bute Councillors (including Cllr MacKay) and 5 Community Councillors from across the area (out of a possible 16) were present. The official call for the meeting went out extremely late, so that the Chair only received it the day after the meeting, but managed to attend by hearing about it via another route.

- Police issues were discussed, with Insp Julie McLeish reporting that the rules on drinking in public places don't cover Soroba or Pulpit Hill.
- There was a LACPG (Lorn Area Community Planning Group) presentation by Iain MacDonald of Ardchattan.
- There was good discussion on how Oban, Lorn and the Isles can move forward as a community. There was a feeling that Community Councillors should pick up on what the community feels are important issues and bring them to the meeting, to avoid rehashing old issues.
- A paper called Difficult Choices for Difficult Times was discussed briefly..
- Cllr Roddy McCuish gave a presentation on REAP, the Renewable Energy Action Plan, on which there will be a CPP consultation in March. There was discussion about the OLI area being placed to take advantage of the business opportunities, such as Oban harbour handling the large boats that service off-shore wind farms. There could be the possibility of a new, deep-water harbour to manage construction of the turbines, which would also require a large amount of on-shore storage capacity, and therefore could not be accommodated in Oban itself. The situation can be compared with the increase in cruise liner traffic into Oban over the past 2 years. The harbour development group and the CHORD group are looking into it.
- Tracker – this would be a list of issues and works required to be addressed by Argyll & Bute Council. The community councils would be able to add items, and then the progress could be viewed regularly.
- Finally, the Argyll & Bute Council website is to be upgraded.

6. Documents to be tabled:

Redesign of Mental Health newsletter
NHS Highland Vision
SEPA magazine

7. Date of Next Meeting:

25th January 2010, Seil Island Hall, 7 p.m.

Signed:

Chairman:

Date:

Signed:

Secretary:

Date: